

April 7, 2021

The Honourable David Lametti Minister of Justice and Attorney General of Canada

## The Honourable Steven Guilbeault Minister of Canadian Heritage

## Dear Ministers Lametti and Guilbeault,

As organizations committed to the defence of human rights, civil liberties, and the eradication of discrimination, we know first-hand that online hate presents a growing threat to people in Canada. We have seen web-based platforms and social media applications become breeding grounds and organizing spaces for the most vile oppressive groups, consistently falling short of blocking blatantly racist, antisemitic, or otherwise hateful content.

We appreciate that the government of Canada is taking the problem seriously and tabling new legislation to address online hate. This is an important step that will help bring existing hate speech legislation into the 21st century. However, a clear line must be drawn between bona fide hate speech and legitimate forms of dissent and protest. We are particularly concerned with where that line may fall between clear instances of antisemitism, on one hand, and criticism of the state of Israel, on the other.

There is a concerted effort by some groups to blur this line. In lockstep with the <u>Israeli</u> <u>government</u>, pro-Israel advocacy organizations in Canada are urging Canada to connect the <u>deeply flawed</u> and <u>widely rejected</u> International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance working definition of antisemitism (IHRA-WDA) with this new online hate legislation. The IHRA definition represents a direct threat to protected freedom of expression because it conflates criticism of Israel and Zionism with antisemitism - for example, by <u>falsely branding as antisemitic</u> the claim that "the existence of a state of Israel is a racist endeavour". Moreover, as <u>numerous cases</u> <u>have illustrated</u>, the IHRA definition has been weaponized in several countries to attack or silence persons or organizations that dare speak out against Israeli human rights violations.

We note that the Jewish community is <u>deeply divided</u> on this issue. There are now <u>several other</u> <u>definitions</u> being proposed by Jewish organizations which make a point of carefully distinguishing criticism of Israel from antisemitism, in contrast to the IHRA definition. Several prominent individuals and organizations both in Canada and around the world have furthermore warned against adopting this definition and its accompanying list of illustrative examples, and/or codifying it into law, including the <u>Reform movement</u>, the largest Jewish denomination in North

America; the <u>Canadian Labour Congress</u>; the <u>Canadian Federation of Students</u>; the <u>Ontario</u> <u>Confederation of Faculty Associations</u>; over <u>600 Canadian academics</u>; over <u>150 Jewish</u> <u>Canadian academics</u>, 21 <u>Canadian academic unions and associations</u>; 122 <u>Palestinian and</u> <u>Arab intellectuals</u>, a <u>broad coalition of progressive Zionist organizations</u>; and even <u>Kenneth</u> <u>Stern</u>, the lead drafter of the definition himself.

In August 2020, several organizations, including the Canadian Civil Liberties Association, the <u>BC Civil Liberties Association</u>, the Centre for Free Expression at Ryerson University, and <u>Independent Jewish Voices Canada</u> were invited to participate in consultations with the federal Department of Justice to discuss the best methods for combating online hate. In their submissions to the Minister and Parliamentary Secretary, these organizations asserted that while it is imperative to rigorously condemn antisemitism in all its forms, the federal government must not do so by conflating criticism of Israel with antisemitism.

Let's tackle online hate, but let's do so while protecting our Charter-protected freedoms of thought, belief, opinion and expression. We stand firm in this position and we urge you to do the same by not adopting the IHRA definition of antisemitism into online hate legislation or any accompanying interpretative guidelines and affiliated policies.

## Signed:

Arab Canadian Lawyers Association Canada Palestine Association Canadian Arab Institute **Canadian BDS Coalition** Canadian Federation of Students Canadian Foreign Policy Institute Canadian Friends Service Committee (Quakers) Canadian Union of Postal Workers Canadian Unitarians for Social Justice Canadians for Justice and Peace in the Middle East Canadians United Against Hate CanPalNet - Canada Palestine Support Network Confédérations des syndicats nationaux (CSN) Conseil régional FTQ Montréal métropolitain **Courage Coalition** Independent Jewish Voices Canada Jewish Liberation Theology Institute Just Peace Advocates Justice For Palestinians, Calgary Lique des droits et libertés Mennonite Church Canada Palestine-Israel Network Mennonite Church Manitoba Palestine-Israel Working Group Niagara Movement for Justice in Palestine-Israel (NMJPI) Oakville Palestinian Rights Association

Ottawa Forum on Israel/Palestine Palestinian Canadian Congress Palestinian Youth Movement Samidoun Palestinian Prisoner Solidarity Network The Association Of Palestinian Arab Canadians The Canadian Palestinian Council The Canadian Palestinian Social Society of London The United Church of Canada United Jewish People's Order (UJPO) United Network for Justice and Peace in Palestine-Israel Coalition of Canadian Palestinian Organizations: Arab Palestine Association of Ontario Palestine House Canadian Arab Forum of BC Association of Palestinian Arab Canadians Canada Palestine Cultural Association (Edmonton) Canadian Palestinian Social Association **Canadian Palestinian Council** Humans Without Borders The Palestinian Association of Brantford Atlantic Canada Palestinian Society Canadian Palestinian Association of Manitoba Canadian Arab Society of London Palestinian Association of Hamilton Palestinian-Canadian Foundation of Quebec Run for Palestine, Edmonton The Canadian Palestinian Professional Association

## Cc:

Arif Virani, Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister of Justice Iqra Khalid, Chair, Standing Committee of Justice and Human Rights Scott Simms, Chair, Standing Committee on Canadian Heritage Randall Garrison, NDP Justice Critic Alexandre Boulerice, NDP Heritage Critic The Honourable Rob Moore, Conservative Justice Critic Alain Rayes, Conservative Heritage Critic Rhéal Fortin, Bloc Québecois Justice Critic Martin Champoux, Bloc Québecois Heritage Critic